NYSCEF DOC. NO. 840

INDEX NO. 651786/2011

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/28/2013

# SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK APPELLATE DIVISION, FIRST DEPARTMENT

In the matter of the application of

THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON (as Trustee under various Pooling and Servicing Agreements and Indenture Trustee under various Indentures), *et al.* 

Petitioners,

Index No. 651786/2011

PRE-ARGUMENT STATEMENT

for an order, pursuant to C.P.L.R. § 7701, seeking judicial instructions and approval of a proposed settlement.

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that the undersigned Intervenors-Appellants in this matter respectfully submit this pre-argument statement pursuant to § 600.17 of the Rules of this Court.

**Full Title of Action**: In the Matter of the Application of the Bank of New York Mellon (as Trustee under various Pooling and Servicing Agreements and Indenture Trustee under various Indentures), BlackRock Financial Management Inc. (intervenor), Kore Advisors, L.P. (intervenor), Maiden Lane, LLC (intervenor), Maiden Lane II, LLC (intervenor), Maiden Lane III, LLC (intervenor), Metropolitan Life Insurance Company (intervenor), Trust Company of the West and affiliated companies controlled by The TCW Group, Inc. (intervenor), Neuberger Berman Europe Limited (intervenor), Pacific Investment Management Company LLC (intervenor), Goldman Sachs Asset Management, L.P. (intervenor), Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association of America (intervenor), Invesco Advisers, Inc. (intervenor), Thrivent Financial for Lutherans (intervenor), Landesbank Baden-Wuerttemberg (intervenor), LBBW Asset Management (Ireland) plc, Dublin (intervenor), ING Bank fsb (intervenor), ING Capital LLC (intervenor), ING. Investment Management LLC (intervenor), New York Life Investment Management LLC (intervenor), Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company and its affiliated companies (intervenor), AEGON USA Investment Management LLC, authorized signatory for Transamerica Life Insurance Company, AEGON Financial Assurance Ireland Limited, Transamerica Life International (Bermuda) Ltd., Monumental Life Insurance Company, Transamerica Advisors Life Insurance Company, AEGON Global Institutional Markets, plc, LIICA Re II, Inc., Pine Falls Re, Inc., Transamerica Financial Life Insurance Company, Stonebridge Life insurance Company, and Western Reserve Life Assurance Co. of Ohio (intervenor), Federal Home Loan Bank of Atlanta (intervenor), Bayerische Landesbank (intervenor), Prudential Investment Management, Inc. (intervenor), Western Asset Management Company (intervenor) Petitioners, for an order, pursuant

## 2. Full Names of Original Parties:

- a. Petitioners: The Bank of New York Mellon, BlackRock Financial Management Inc. (intervenor), Kore Advisors, L.P. (intervenor), Maiden Lane, LLC (intervenor), Maiden Lane II, LLC (intervenor), Maiden Lane III, LLC (intervenor), Metropolitan Life Insurance Company (intervenor), Trust Company of the West and affiliated companies controlled by The TCW Group, Inc. (intervenor), Neuberger Berman Europe Limited (intervenor), Pacific Investment Management Company LLC (intervenor), Goldman Sachs Asset Management, L.P. (intervenor), Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association of America (intervenor), Invesco Advisers, Inc. (intervenor), Thrivent Financial for Lutherans (intervenor), Landesbank Baden-Wuerttemberg (intervenor), LBBW Asset Management (Ireland) plc, Dublin (intervenor), ING Bank fsb (intervenor), ING Capital LLC (intervenor), ING. Investment Management LLC (intervenor), New York Life Investment Management LLC (intervenor), Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company and its affiliated companies (intervenor), AEGON USA Investment Management LLC, authorized signatory for Transamerica Life Insurance Company, AEGON Financial Assurance Ireland Limited, Transamerica Life International (Bermuda) Ltd., Monumental Life Insurance Company, Transamerica Advisors Life Insurance Company, AEGON Global Institutional Markets, plc, LIICA Re II, Inc., Pine Falls Re, Inc., Transamerica Financial Life Insurance Company, Stonebridge Life insurance Company, and Western Reserve Life Assurance Co. of Ohio (intervenor), Federal Home Loan Bank of Atlanta (intervenor), Bayerische Landesbank (intervenor), Prudential Investment Management, Inc. (intervenor), and Western Asset Management Company (intervenor).
- b. Intervenors/Objectors: Cranberry Park II LLC; Cranberry Park LLC; Federal Home Loan Bank of San Francisco; Federal Home Loan Bank of Seattle; TM1 Investors, LLC; Walnut Place II LLC; Walnut Place IV LLC; Walnut Place IX LLC; Walnut Place LLC; Walnut Place V LLC; Walnut Place VI LLC; Walnut Place VII LLC; Walnut Place VIII LLC; Walnut Place XLLC; Walnut Place XI LLC; Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation; RMBS Acquisition Co, LLC; Federal Home Loan Bank of Boston; Federal Home Loan Bank of Chicago; Federal Home Loan Bank of Indianapolis; Federal Home Loan Bank of Pittsburgh; City of Grand Rapids General Retirement System; City of Grand Rapids Police and Fire Retirement System; Retirement Board of the Policeman's Annuity and Benefit fund of the City of Chicago; The Westmoreland County Employee Retirement System; The Western and Southern Life Insurance Company; Western-Southern Life Assurance Company; Columbus Life Insurance Company; Integrity Life Insurance Company; National Integrity Life Insurance Company; Fort Washington Investment Advisors, Inc. (on behalf of Fort Washington Active Fixed Income LLC); Mortgage Bond Portfolio LLC; Triaxx Prime CDO 2006-1, Ltd.; Triaxx

Prime CDO 2006-2, Ltd.; Triaxx Prime CDO 2007-1, Ltd.; American International Group, Inc.; American General Assurance Company, American General Life and Accident Insurance Company; American General Life Insurance Company; American General Life Insurance Company of Delaware; American Home Assurance Company; American International Life Assurance Company of New York; Chartis Property Casualty Company; Chartis Select Insurance Company; Commerce and Industry Insurance Company; First SunAmerica Life Insurance Company; Lexington Insurance Company; National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA; New Hampshire Insurance Company; SunAmerica Annuity and Life Assurance Company; SunAmerica Life Insurance Company; The Insurance Company of the State of Pennsylvania; The United States Life Insurance Company in the City of New York; The Variable Annuity Life Insurance Company; Western National Life Insurance Company; First Reliance Standard Life Insurance Company; Liberty View; Platinum Underwriters Bermuda, Ltd.; Platinum Underwriters Reinsurance, Inc.; Reliance Standard Life Insurance Company; Safety National Casualty Corporation; Sun Life Insurance Company of Canada; CA Core Fixed Income Fund, LLC; CA Core Fixed Income Fund, Ltd.; CA High Yield Fund, LLC; CA High Yield Fund, Ltd.; Strategic Equity Fund, LLC; Strategic Equity Fund, Ltd.; Sand Spring Capital III Master Fund, LLC; Knights of Columbus; American Equity Investment Life Insurance Company; American Equity Investment Life Insurance Company of New York; Amici Associates, LP; Amici Fund International Ltd., Amici Qualified Associates; Blue Mountain Credit Alternatives Master Fund, LP; Cedar Hill Capital Partners LLC; Cedar Hill Mortgage Fund GP LLC; Cedar Hill Mortgage Opportunity Master Fund LLP; Declaration Management & Research LLC; Doubleline Capital LP; First Bank; First Financial of Maryland Federal Credit Union; First National Bank & Trust Co. of Rochelle, Illinois; First National Banking Company; First Penn-Pacific Life Insurance Company; Kerndt Brothers Savings Bank; Lea County State Bank; LibreMax Capital LLC; Lincoln Investment Solutions, Inc.; Lincoln Life & Annuity Company of New York; Lincoln National Reinsurance Company (Barbados) Limited; LL Funds LLC; Manichean Capital, LLC; NCMIC Group, Inc.; NCMIC Insurance Company; NexBank, SSB; Peoples Independent Bank; Radian Asset Assurance Inc.; Stone Creek LLC; Taconic Capital Advisors LP; The Collectors' Fund LP; The Lincoln National Life Insurance Company; Thomaston Savings Bank; Valley National Bank; CIFG Assurance North America, Inc.; American Fidelity Assurance Company; United States Debt Recovery VIII, LP; United States Debt Recovery X, LP; Bankers Trust Company; Bankers Life Insurance Company; Bankers Specialty Insurance Company; First Community Insurance Company; Sterling Federal Bank, FSB; Oriental Bank and Trust; Maine State Retirement System; Pension Trust Fund for Operating Engineers; Vermont Pension Investment Committee; Washington State Plumbing and Pipefitting Pension Trust; Goldman Sachs & Co. Securities Division; Pine River Fixed Income Master Fund Ltd.; Pine River Master Fund Ltd; Silver Sands Fund LLC; Two Harbors Asset I LLC; Good Hill Partners LP; Syncora Guarantee Inc.; Federal Housing Finance Agency as Conservator for

the Federal National Mortgage Association and the Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation; National Credit Union Administration Board as Liquidating Agent of US Central Federal Credit Union, Western Corp. Fed. Credit Union, Members United Corp. Fed. Credit Union, Southwest Corp. Fed. Credit Union, Constitution Corp. Fed. Credit Union; Ballantyne Re Place; the State Attorneys General for the State of New York and Delaware.

c. The parties in the original action have changed. The following parties to the original action have withdrawn from the proceeding: Federal Home Loan Bank of San Francisco; Federal Home Loan Bank of Seattle; TM1 Investors, LLC; Walnut Place II LLC; Walnut Place III LLC; Walnut Place IV LLC; Walnut Place IX LLC; Walnut Place LLC; Walnut Place V LLC; Walnut Place VI LLC; Walnut Place VII LLC; Walnut Place VIII LLC; Walnut Place XLLC; Walnut Place XI LLC; Oriental Bank and Trust; Maine State Retirement System; Pension Trust Fund for Operating Engineers; Vermont Pension Investment Committee; Washington State Plumbing and Pipefitting Pension Trust; LibreMax Capital LLC; Clayhill Investors LLC; Syncora Guarantee Inc.; Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation; RMBS Acquisition Co, LLC; Federal Housing Finance Agency as Conservator for the Federal National Mortgage Association and the Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation; National Credit Union Administration Board as Liquidating Agent of US Central Federal Credit Union; Western Corp. Fed. Credit Union; Members United Corp. Fed. Credit Union, Southwest Corp. Fed. Credit Union; Constitution Corp. Fed. Credit Union.

## 3. <u>Counsel for Intervenors/Objectors-Appellants</u>:

#### REILLY POZNER LLP

Daniel Reilly Michael Rollin 1900 Sixteenth St., Ste. 1700 Denver, Colorado 80202 Telephone: (303) 893-6100 Fax: (303) 893-1500 dreilly@rplaw.com

mrollin@rplaw.com
Counsel for AIG Entities

#### MILLER & WRUBEL P.C.

John G. Moon 570 Lexington Avenue New York, New York 10022 Telephone: (212) 336-3500 Fax: (212) 336-3555

Fax: (212) 336-3555 jmoon@mw-law.com

Counsel for the Triaxx Entities

#### KELLER ROHRBACK LLP

Derek W. Loeser David J. Ko

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200

Seattle, Washington 98101 Telephone: (206) 623-1900

Fax: (206) 623-3384

dloeser@kellerrohrback.com dko@kellerrohrback.com

Gary A. Gotto

3101 North Central Avenue

Phoenix, Arizona 85012

Telephone: (602) 248-0088

Fax: (602) 248-2822 ggotto@krplc.com

Counsel for Federal Home Loan Banks of Boston, Chicago, and Indianapolis

### FEDERMAN & SHERWOOD

William B. Federman

10205 North Pennsylvania Ave.

Oklahoma City, OK 73120 Telephone: (405) 235-1560 Facsimile: (405) 239-2112

wbf@federmanlaw.com

Counsel for American Fidelity Assurance Company

## ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.

Thomas B. Hatch Bruce D. Manning

2800 LaSalle Plaza

800 LaSalle Avenue

Minneapolis, MN 55402

Tel: (612) 349-8500 Fax: (612) 339-4181

Counsel for Federal Home Loan Bank of Pittsburgh

#### WOLLMUTH MAHER & DEUTSCH LLP

David H. Wollmuth Steven S. Fitzgerald 500 Fifth Avenue

New York, New York 10110

Tel: (212) 382-3300 Fax: (212) 382-0500

Counsel for The Western and Southern Life Insurance Company, Western-Southern Life Assurance Company, Columbus Life Insurance Company, Integrity Life Insurance Company, National Integrity Life Insurance Company, and Fort Washington Investment Advisors, Inc.

## 4. Counsel for Petitioners-Respondents:

Matthew D. Ingber Mayer Brown LLP 1675 Broadway New York, NY 10019 (212) 506-2500 mingber@mayerbrown.com

Hector Gonzalez
Dechert LLP
1095 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
(212) 698-3500
hector.gonzalez@dechert.com
Counsel for the Bank of New York Mellon

Kathy D. Patrick
Robert J. Madden
Scott A. Humphries
Kate Kaufmann Shih
Gibbs & Bruns LLP
1100 Louisiana, Suite 5300
Houston, TX 77002
(713) 650-8805
kpatrick@gibbsbruns.com
rmadden@gibbsbruns.com
kshih@gibbsbruns.com

Warner Partners, PC
Kenneth E. Warner
Lewis S. Fischbein
950 Third Avenue, 32<sup>nd</sup> Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212) 593-8000
<a href="mailto:kwarner@warnerpartnerslaw.com">kwarner@warnerpartnerslaw.com</a>
Counsel for Institutional Investors

## 5. Counsel for Other Objectors/Intervenors:

Scott & Scott LLP

Beth A. Kaswan

Max Schwartz

500 Fifth Avenue, 40<sup>th</sup> Floor

New York, NY 10110-4099

Counsel for City of Grand Rapids General Retirement System; City of Grand Rapids Police and Fire Retirement System; Retirement Board of the Policeman's Annuity and Benefit fund of the City of Chicago; The Westmoreland County Employee Retirement System

Schlam Stone & Dolan LLP

Jeffrey M. Eilender

Bradley J. Nash

26 Broadway

New York, NY 10004

Counsel for First Reliance Standard Life Insurance Company; Liberty View; Platinum Underwriters Bermuda, Ltd.; Platinum Underwriters Reinsurance, Inc.; Reliance Standard Life Insurance Company; Safety National Casualty Corporation; Sun Life Insurance Company of Canada

Sher Tremone LLP

Justin M. Sher

41 Madison Avenue, 41<sup>st</sup> Floor

New York, NY 10010

Counsel for CA Core Fixed Income Fund, LLC; CA Core Fixed Income Fund, Ltd.; CA High Yield Fund, LLC; CA High Yield Fund, Ltd.; Strategic Equity Fund, LLC; Strategic Equity Fund, Ltd.; Sand Spring Capital III Master Fund, LLC

### TALCOTT FRANKLIN P.C.

Talcott J. Franklin

Martha Evans

Dennis Taylor

208 North Market Street, Suite 200

Dallas, Texas 75202

Counsel for Knights of Columbus

## TALCOTT FRANKLIN P.C.

Talcott J. Franklin

Martha Evans

Dennis Taylor

208 North Market Street, Suite 200

Dallas, Texas 75202

-and-

Peter N. Tsapatsarid 200 East 33<sup>rd</sup> Street, 27<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite D New York, NY 10016

Counsel for American Equity Investment Life Insurance Company; Amererican Equity
Investment Life Insurance Company of New York; Amici Associates, LP; Amici Fund
International Ltd., Amici Qualified Associates; Blue Mountain Credit Alternatives Master Fund,
LP; Cedar Hill Capital Partners LLC; Cedar Hill Mortgage Fund GP LLC; Cedar Hill
Mortgage Opportunity Master Fund LLP; Declaration Management & Research LLC;
Doubleline Capital LP; First Bank; First Financial of Maryland Federal Credit Union; First
National Bank & Trust Co. of Rochelle, Illinois; First National Banking Company; First PennPacific Life Insurance Company; Kerndt Brothers Savings Bank; Lea County State Bank;
Lincoln Investment Solutions, Inc.; Lincoln Life & Annuity Company of New York; Lincoln
National Reinsurance Company (Barbados) Limited; LL Funds LLC; Manichean Capital, LLC;
NCMIC Group, Inc.; NCMIC Insurance Company; NexBank, SSB; Peoples Independent Bank;
Radian Asset Assurance Inc.; Stone Creek LLC; Taconic Capital Advisors LP; The Collectors'
Fund LP; The Lincoln National Life Insurance Company; Thomaston Savings Bank; Valley
National Bank

#### **CIFG**

Sarah E. Lieber 850 Third Avenue, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10022 Counsel for CIFG Assurance North America, Inc.

#### HALPERIN BATTAGLIA RAICHT, LLP

Donna H. Lieberman, Esq. Scott A. Ziluck, Esq. 555 Madison Avenue, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10022

Counsel for United States Debt Recovery VIII, LP; United States Debt Recovery X, LP

Kopelowitz Ostrow Ferguson Weiselberg Keechl

Jason H. Alperstein

200 SW 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Suite 1200

Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

Counsel for Bankers Trust Company; Bankers Life Insurance Company; Bankers Specialty Insurance Company; First Community Insurance Company; Sterling Federal Bank, FSB

Vandenberg & Feliu, LLP Bertrand C. Sellier John C. Ohman 60 East 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, 51<sup>st</sup> Floor New York, NY 10165

Counsel for Goldman Sachs & Co. Securities Division; Pine River Fixed Income Master Fund Ltd.; Pine River Master Fund Ltd; Silver Sands Fund LLC; Two Harbors Asset I LLC

Yankwitt & McGuire, LLP Russell M. Yankwitt Kathy S. Marks 140 Grand Street, Penthouse 2 White Plains, NY 10601 Counsel for Good Hill Partners LP

Shapiro Forman Allen & Sava LLP Yoram Miller Michael I. Allen 380 Madison Avenue New York, NY 10017 Counsel for Ballantyne Re Place

Wollmuth Maher & Deutsch LLP David H. Wollmuth Steven S. Fitzgerald 500 Fifth Avenue New York, New York 10110

Tel: (212) 382-3300 Fax: (212) 382-0500

Counsel Cranberry Park II LLC and Cranberry Park LLC

- 6. <u>Court from Which Appeal Is Taken</u>: Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York (Kapnick, J.).
- 7. Nature and Object of the Action: This is an Article 77 proceeding brought by the Petitioner, the Bank of New York Mellon, as Trustee acting on behalf of certificateholders for 530 separate residential-mortgage backed securities trusts seeking judicial instructions and approval of a proposed settlement agreement to settle claims that the Bank of New York Mellon may have brought against the Bank of America and Countrywide, for alleged servicing and mortgage origination failures. In conjunction with its petition, the Bank of New York Mellon seeks through its Proposed Order and Final Judgment at least 18 separate factual findings related to the Bank of New York Mellon's conduct in negotiating and entering the proposed settlement agreement, as well as a release of all claims that certificateholders have or

would have in the future related to the Bank of New York Mellon's conduct with respect to its negotiation and entry into the proposed settlement on behalf of all certificateholders.

8. **Result Reached Below**: In a Decision and Order dated May 21, 2013, the Supreme Court granted Petitioners' order to show cause to strike Intervenors' jury demand, despite the fact that CPLR § 410 expressly provides parties to special proceedings with the right to demand a jury on all *issues* triable of right by jury.

The undersigned Intervenors appeal from the Decision and Order entered in the offices of the Clerk of the Court on May 21, 2013, and from every part thereof. A copy of the Decision and Order, along with the NYSCEF Confirmation Notice, the May 20, 2013 hearing transcript incorporated into the Decision and Order by reference, and the accompanying Notice of Entry, served by undersigned via NYSCEF on May 28, 2013, is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

- 9. Grounds for Seeking Reversal: The ground for seeking reversal is that the trial court improperly struck Intervenors' jury demand despite the plain language of CPLR § 410, which allows for a jury trial in special proceedings on all "issues" triable of right by jury. This Article 77 proceeding qualifies because the Bank of New York Mellon seeks not only prospective guidance about a proposed settlement agreement that it has entered into on behalf of all certificateholders, but also factual findings related to the Bank of New York Mellon's conduct in negotiating and entering the proposed settlement agreement and to eliminate legal claims that would be jury-triable as a matter of constitutional right.
- 10. **Related Actions or Proceedings**: There are no additional appeals pending in this action. The original proceeding remains pending in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, Index No. 651786/2011.

## Dated this 28th day of May, 2013.

#### REILLY POZNER LLP

By: \_\_s/Michael A. Rollin
Daniel Reilly (admitted pro hac vice)
Michael Rollin
1900 Sixteenth St., Ste. 1700
Denver, Colorado 80202
Telephone: (303) 893-6100
Fax: (303) 893-1500
dreilly@rplaw.com
mrollin@rplaw.com

Attorneys for AIG Entities

#### KELLER ROHRBACK LLP

By: \_\_s/ Derek W. Loeser Derek W. Loeser David J. Ko 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3200 Seattle, Washington 98101 Telephone: (206) 623-1900 Fax: (206) 623-3384 dloeser@kellerrohrback.com

> Gary A. Gotto 3101 North Central Avenue Phoenix, Arizona 85012

dko@kellerrohrback.com

Telephone: (602) 248-0088 Fax: (602) 248-2822 ggotto@krplc.com

Attorneys for Federal Home Loan Banks of Boston, Chicago, and Indianapolis

#### MILLER & WRUBEL P.C.

By: s/John G. Moon
John G. Moon
Claire L. Huene
570 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10022
Telephone: (212) 336-3500
Fax: (212) 336-3555
jmoon@mw-law.com
chuene@mw-law.com

Attorneys for the Triaxx Entities

ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.

By: s/ Thomas B. Hatch

Thomas B. Hatch (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Bruce D. Manning (*admitted pro hac vice*)
2800 LaSalle Plaza
800 LaSalle Avenue
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel: (612) 349-8500

Fax: (612) 339-4181

Counsel of Federal Home Loan Bank of Pittsburgh

### FEDERMAN & SHERWOOD

By: <u>s/William B. Federman</u>

William B. Federman 10205 North Pennsylvania Ave. Oklahoma City, OK 73120 Telephone: (405) 235-1560

Facsimile: (405) 239-2112 wbf@federmanlaw.com

Attorneys for American Fidelity Assurance Company

# WOLLMUTH MAHER & DEUTSCH LLP

By: \_\_\_*s/Steven S. Fitzgerald*\_\_\_\_\_

David H. Wollmuth Steven S. Fitzgerald 500 Fifth Avenue New York, New York 10110

Tel: (212) 382-3300 Fax: (212) 382-0500

Attorneys for The Western and Southern Life Insurance Company, Western-Southern Life Assurance Company, Columbus Life Insurance Company, Integrity Life Insurance Company, National Integrity Life Insurance Company, and Fort Washington Investment Advisors, Inc.