NYSCEF DOC. NO. 907

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

In the matter of the application of

THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON (as Trustee under various Pooling and Servicing Agreements and Indenture Trustee under various Indentures), *et al.*,

Petitioners,

for an order, pursuant to C.P.L.R. § 7701, seeking judicial instructions and approval of a proposed settlement.

Index No. 651786-2011

Kapnick, J.

SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF REGARDING NON-JURIDICAL STATUS OF THE COVERED TRUSTS

WARNER PARTNERS, P.C. Kenneth E. Warner 950 Third Avenue, 32nd Floor New York, New York 10022 (212) 593-8000 GIBBS & BRUNS LLP Kathy D. Patrick (*pro hac vice*) Robert J. Madden (*pro hac vice*) Scott A. Humphries (*pro hac vice*) David Sheeren (*pro hac vice*) 1100 Louisiana, Suite 5300 Houston, Texas 77002 (713) 650-8805

Counsel for the Institutional Investors, Intervenor-Petitioners

DECHERT LLP Hector Gonzalez James M. McGuire Mauricio A. España 1095 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10036 (212) 698-3500 MAYER BROWN LLP Matthew D. Ingber Christopher J. Houpt 1675 Broadway New York, New York 10019 (212) 506-2500

Attorneys for Petitioner The Bank of New York Mellon It is a widely recognized principle that "[a] trust is not a legal entity. A trust is not an entity distinct from its trustees and capable of legal action on its own behalf . . . ," Am. Jur. 2d Trusts § 3 (2013); *see also* Amy Morris Hess, George Gleason Bogert & George Taylor Bogert, <u>Bogert's Trusts and Trustees</u> § 712 (2012) ("A trust is not a legal person, nor is the trust property."). Consistent with this general principle, C.P.L.R. 1004 permits a trustee to sue or be sued in its own name, and New York courts have held that trusts may only take legal action through their trustees. *See Kirschbaum v. Elizabeth Ortman Trust of 1977*, 3 Misc. 3d 1110(A), 2004 WL 1372542, at *2 (Sup. Ct. Suffolk Cnty. Mar. 10, 2004) ("The trustees as legal owners of the trust estate generally sue and are sued in their own capacity. The trust itself does not have the capacity to sell the estate.") (internal citation omitted); *Haag v. Turney*, 240 A.D. 149, 151 (1st Dep't 1934) (holding that predecessor statute to C.P.L.R. 1004 was "uniformly construed by the courts to mean that the trustee shall sue in his own name and not in his representative capacity").

Other state and federal jurisdictions similarly recognize that the trust itself — in contrast to the trustee — is incapable of legal action. *See, e.g., Greenspan v. LADT, LLC*, 191 Cal. App. 4th 486, 521 (Cal. Ct. App. 2010) ("because '[a] trust is not a legal entity,' it 'cannot sue or be sued, but rather legal proceedings are properly directed at the trustee."") (internal citation omitted); *Sec. Life of Denver Ins. Co. v. Shah*, 2011 WL 2181485, at *1 (S.D. Ga. June 2, 2011) ("The trustee *is* the real party in interest in such a claim, not the trust itself. In fact, if the trust itself were joined to the action and attempted to assert such claims against SBN and Howie, the Court would be required to dismiss them.") (citation omitted) (emphasis in original).

Dated: New York, New York July 17, 2013

WARNER PARTNERS, P.C.

By: <u>/s/ Kenneth E. Warner</u> Kenneth E. Warner 950 Third Avenue, 32nd Floor New York, New York 10022 (212) 593-8000

> GIBBS & BRUNS LLP Kathy D. Patrick (*pro hac vice*) Robert J. Madden (*pro hac vice*) Scott A. Humphries (*pro hac vice*) David Sheeren (*pro hac vice*) 1100 Louisiana, Suite 5300 Houston, Texas 77002 (713) 650-8805

Attorneys for Intervenor-Petitioners, BlackRock Financial Management Inc., Kore Advisors, L.P., Maiden Lane, LLC, Maiden Lane II, LLC, Maiden Lane III, LLC, Metropolitan Life Insurance Company, Trust Company of the West and affiliated companies controlled by The TCW Group, Inc., Neuberger Berman Europe Limited, PIMCO Investment Management Company LLC, Goldman Sachs Asset Management, L.P., as adviser to its funds and accounts, Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association of America, Invesco Advisers, Inc., Thrivent Financial for Lutherans, Landesbank Baden-Wuerttemberg, LBBW Asset Management (Ireland) plc, Dublin, ING Bank N.V., ING Capital LLC, ING Investment Management LLC, New York Life Investment Management LLC, as investment manager, Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company and its affiliated companies, AEGON USA Investment Management LLC, authorized signatory for Transamerica Life Insurance Company, AEGON Financial Assurance Ireland Limited, Transamerica Life International (Bermuda) Ltd., Monumental Life Insurance Company, Transamerica Advisors Life Insurance Company, AEGON Global Institutional Markets, plc, LIICA Re II, Inc., Pine Falls Re, Inc., Transamerica Financial Life Insurance Company, Stonebridge Life Insurance Company, and Western Reserve Life Assurance Co. of Ohio, Federal Home Loan Bank of Atlanta, Bayerische Landesbank, Prudential Investment Management, Inc., and Western Asset Management Company

DECHERT LLP Hector Gonzalez James M. McGuire Mauricio A. España 1095 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10036 (212) 698-3500 MAYER BROWN LLP

/s/ Matthew D. Ingber

Matthew D. Ingber Christopher J. Houpt 1675 Broadway New York, New York 10019 (212) 506-2500

Attorneys for Petitioner The Bank of New York Mellon